

PHGA 7169  
THE IDEA OF TRANSCENDENTAL PHILOSOPHY  
FALL 2007  
TUESDAYS, 2:00 – 4:00

---

JOHN J. DRUMMOND  
103 COLLINS HALL  
718-817-3332  
drummond@fordham.edu  
<http://www.fordham.edu/philosophy/drummond>

---

OFFICE HOURS  
Mondays and Thursdays, 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
And By Appointment

---

### *Introduction*

This course will investigate the meaning, the nature, and the possibility of transcendental philosophy. In particular, the course will focus on distinguishing (externally) transcendental philosophy from a metaphysical approach to consciousness and (internally) the transcendental philosophies of Kant, Husserl, and Heidegger (of the 1920s). This investigation will be ordered around three broad themes:

1. The scope of transcendental philosophy (e.g., is the notion of the transcendental epistemological or ontological in character; is it limited to the cognitive domain or not).
2. The character of transcendental inquiry.
3. The nature of transcendental subjectivity and the question of transcendental idealism.

### *Readings*

- Aquila, Richard E. 1976. Two kinds of transcendental arguments in Kant. *Kant-Studien* 67: 1–19.
- Allison, Henry. 2004. *Kant's Transcendental Idealism*. New Haven: Yale University Press, pp. 3–73, 159–201, 285–303.
- Bell, David. 1999. Transcendental arguments and non-naturalistic anti-realism. In *Transcendental Arguments: Problems and Prospects*. Ed. R. Stern, 189–210. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Cassam, Quassim. 1999. Self-directed transcendental arguments. In *Transcendental Arguments: Problems and Prospects*. Ed. R. Stern, 83–110. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Franks, Paul. 1999. Transcendental arguments, reason, and scepticism: contemporary debates and the origins of post-Kantianism. In *Transcendental Arguments: Problems and Prospects*. Ed. R. Stern, 111–47. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Heidegger, Martin. 1988. *The Basic Problems of Phenomenology*. Trans. A. Hofstadter. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, pp. 122–54.

- . 1997. *Kant and the Problem of Metaphysics*. Trans. R. Taft. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, pp. 46–63 (on reserve).
- . 1997. *Phenomenological Interpretation of Kant's Critique of Pure Reason*. Trans. P. Emad and K. Maly. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, pp. 1–12, 206–62.
- Hookway, Christopher. 1999. Modest transcendental arguments and sceptical doubts. In *Transcendental Arguments: Problems and Prospects*. Ed. R. Stern, 173–88. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Husserl, Edmund. 1970. *Cartesian Meditations: An Introduction to Phenomenology*. Trans. D. Cairns. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, pp. 1–55, 65–68.
- . 1970. *The Crisis of European Sciences and Transcendental Phenomenology*. Trans. D. Carr. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, pp. 73–84, 88–121, 159–86, 191–210.
- . 1999. *The Idea of Phenomenology*. Trans. L. Hardy. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, pp. 15–55.
- . 1983. *Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy. First Book: General Introduction to a Pure Phenomenology*. Trans. F. Kersten. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, pp. 171–81, 190–201.
- . Kant and the idea of transcendental philosophy. Trans. T. E. Klein and W. E. Pohl. *Southwestern Journal of Philosophy* 5: 9–56.
- Kant, Immanuel. *Critique of Pure Reason* (any edition), Avii–xxii, Bvii–xxxvii, B24–30, A50–66/B74–91, B102–16, A84–94/B116–29, A95–130, B129–69, B232–56, B274–79, A293–98/B349–55.
- Körner, Stephan. 1967. The impossibility of transcendental deductions. *The Monist* 51: 317–31.
- Malpas, Jeff. 1990. Transcendental arguments and conceptual schemes: a reconsideration of Körner's uniqueness argument. *Kant-Studien* 81: 232–51.
- . The transcendental circle. *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* 75: 1–20.
- McDowell, John. 1996. *Mind and World*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Ollig, Hans-Ludwig. 1998. Neo-Kantianism. In the *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Ed. E. Craig (online).
- Thomas Aquinas, Saint. 1952. *De veritate*, q. 1, a. 1; q. 21, aa. 1–3.
- Rosen, Michael. 1999. From Kant to Fichte: a reply to Franks, in *Transcendental Arguments: Problems and Prospects*. Ed. R. Stern, 147–54. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Schaper, Eva. 1972. Arguing transcendentially. *Kant-Studien* 63: 101–16.
- . 1974. Are transcendental arguments impossible? In *Kant's Theory of Knowledge*. Ed. L. W. Beck, 3–11. Dordrecht: D. Reidel.
- Strawson, P.F. 1990. *The Bounds of Sense*. New York: Routledge, pp. 15–42, 72–117, 125–40.
- . 1990. *Individuals*. New York: Routledge, pp. 38–40, 87–116.
- Stroud, Barry. 1968. Transcendental arguments. *The Journal of Philosophy* 65: 241–56.
- . 1999. The goal of transcendental argument. In *Transcendental Arguments: Problems and Prospects*. Ed. R. Stern, 155–72. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

### *A Note on the Readings*

I have asked that the library put all the readings, with the exception of the article on neo-Kantianism from the online Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy, on reserve. Some readings will be available only in this way, since the Stern collection of essays is very expensive. Some of the articles are also available in the electronic journals section of the library, and Strawson's *The Bounds of Sense* is available through the library as an e-book. Finally, you might be interested in buying some of the books from which we shall read lengthier excerpts. I have ordered the following books for the bookstore. But you might wish to

order them directly from the publisher (and, of course, you might be able to find used copies on the web for a cheaper price). The publisher information for these books follows:

- Heidegger, *Phenomenological Interpretation of Kant's Critique of Pure Reason*, Indiana University Press, ISBN-13: 978-0-253-33258-5 (cloth only), \$41.95;  
[http://www.iupress.indiana.edu/catalog/product\\_info.php?products\\_id=19750](http://www.iupress.indiana.edu/catalog/product_info.php?products_id=19750).
- Husserl, *Cartesian Meditations*, Springer, ISBN-13: 978-90-247-0068-4 (paper), \$34.95;  
<http://www.springer.com/west/home/philosophy/phenomenology?SGWID=4-40397-22-33739971-0>.
- Husserl, *The Crisis of European Sciences and Transcendental Phenomenology*, Northwestern University Press, ISBN: 0-8101-0458-X (paper), \$27.00;  
<http://nupress.northwestern.edu/title.cfm?ISBN=0-8101-0458-X>.
- Husserl, *The Idea of Phenomenology*, Springer, ISBN-13: 978-0-7923-5691-2 (cloth), \$34.95;  
<http://www.springer.com/west/home/philosophy/phenomenology?SGWID=4-40397-22-33738282-0>.
- McDowell, *Mind and World*, Harvard University Press, ISBN-13: 978-0-674-57610-0, \$21.50;  
<http://www.hup.harvard.edu/catalog/MCDMIN.html>.

I assume that everyone has a copy of Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason*. If not, get one!!!

### *Schedule*

**N.B.** The password for E-Res is "transcendental" (without the quotation marks).

**Date: Assignment:**

- 11 September: Organization and Introduction  
*Topic:* Categories and Transcendentals: Kant's Critique of "Ancient Transcendental Philosophy"  
*Readings:* 1) St. Thomas Aquinas, *De Veritate*, q. 1, a. 1; q. 21, aa. 1, 3.  
 2) Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, Avii–xxii, Bvii–xxxvii, B24–30, A50–66/B74–91, B102–16, A293–98/B349–55.
- 18 September: *Topic:* What Kant's *Critique* Tell Us About the Nature of Transcendental Philosophy and Transcendental Arguments  
*Readings:* 1) Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, A84–94/B116–29, A95–130, B129–69, B232–56, B274–79.
- 25 September: *Topic:* The Nature and Possibility of Transcendental Deductions  
*Readings:* 1) Strawson, *The Bounds of Sense*, pp. 15–42, 72–117, 125–40.  
 2) Strawson, *Individuals*, pp. 38–40, 87–116.  
 3) Stroud, "Transcendental Arguments".
- 2 October: *Topic:* More on the Nature and Possibility of Transcendental Arguments  
*Readings:* 1) Körner, "The Impossibility of Transcendental Deductions".  
 2) Schaper, "Arguing Transcendentally".  
 3) Schaper, "Are Transcendental Arguments Impossible".  
 4) Malpas, "Transcendental Arguments and Conceptual Schemes: A Reconsideration of Körner's Uniqueness Argument".

**Date: Assignment:**

- 11 October: **N.B. Class meets this week on Thursday rather than Tuesday because of the Gannon Lecture**
- Topic:* Post-Kantian and neo-Kantian Views of Transcendental Philosophy  
*Readings:* 1) Franks, “Transcendental Arguments, Reason, and Scepticism: Contemporary Debates and the Origins of Post-Kantianism”.  
 2) Rosen, “From Kant to Fichte: A Reply to Franks”.  
 3) “Neo-Kantianism,” in the *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (online).
- 16 October: *Topic:* Still More on the Nature and Possibility of Transcendental Arguments  
*Readings:* 1) Stroud, “The Goal of Transcendental Argument”.  
 2) Aquila, “Two Kinds of Transcendental Arguments in Kant”.  
 3) Cassam, “Self-Directed Transcendental Arguments”.
- 23 October: *Topic:* And Yet More!  
*Readings:* 1) Hookway, “Modest Transcendental Arguments and Sceptical Doubts”.  
 2) Bell, “Transcendental Arguments and Non-Naturalistic Anti-Realism”.  
 3) Malpas, “The Transcendental Circle”.  
 4) Allison, *Kant’s Transcendental Idealism*, pp. 3–73, 159–201, 285–303.
- 30 October: *Topic:* Critical and Phenomenological Transcendental Philosophies  
*Readings:* 1) Husserl, “Kant and the Idea of Transcendental Philosophy”.
- 6 November: *Topic:* Critical and Phenomenological Transcendental Philosophies  
*Readings:* 1) Husserl, *The Crisis of European Sciences and Transcendental Phenomenology*, pp. 73–84, 88–121.
- 13 November: *Topic:* Critical and Phenomenological Transcendental Philosophies  
*Readings:* 1) Heidegger, *The Basic Problems of Phenomenology*, pp. 122–54.  
 2) Heidegger, *Kant and the Problem of Metaphysics*, pp. 46–63.  
 3) Heidegger, *Phenomenological Interpretation of Kant’s Critique of Pure Reason*, pp. 1–12.
- 20 November: *Topic:* Critical and Phenomenological Transcendental Philosophies  
*Readings:* 1) Heidegger, *Phenomenological Interpretation of Kant’s Critique of Pure Reason*, pp. 206–62.
- 27 November: *Topic:* A Current Version of Transcendental Philosophy?  
*Readings:* 1) McDowell, *Mind and World*, 3–65, 162–74.
- 4 December: *Topic:* A Current Version of Transcendental Philosophy?  
*Readings:* 1) McDowell, *Mind and World*, 66–126, 175–87.

**Date: Assignment:**

- 11 December: *Topic:* Phenomenological Transcendental Philosophy  
*Readings:* 1) Husserl, *The Idea of Phenomenology*, pp. 15–55.  
 2) Husserl, *Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology and to a Phenomenological Philosophy. First Book*, pp. 171–81, 190–201.
- 18 December: *Topic:* Phenomenological Transcendental Philosophy  
*Readings:* 1) Husserl, *Cartesian Meditations*, pp. 1–55, 65–68.  
 2) Husserl, *The Crisis of European Sciences and Transcendental Phenomenology*, pp. 159–86, 191–210.

***Requirements***

1. Participation in class discussions; 10%.
2. Presentation paper, 20%: Each student will write one presentation paper on the readings assigned for the day of the presentation. The paper will be distributed to the class by e-mail no later than midnight of the Friday preceding the class (no later than the preceding Monday midnight for the class of October 11). The paper is not intended as an exposition of the readings. The presenter should focus on the issues common to the readings and form a thesis regarding the readings taken as a whole. The topic headings for each class provide a rough guide for identifying the relevant issues. The paper will not be read in class, but its author will be required to present a ten-minute summary of its main points.
3. Prepared comments, 10% : Each presentation paper will have a commentator. The commentator should prepare a critical comment of approximately ten minutes (approximately 4 pages) that focuses on the presenter's main thesis or argument. The comments will be read in class, and the author of the paper will respond. General discussion will follow.
4. Research paper, 60%: Each student is expected to submit a research paper of 20–25 pages. I recommend that you discuss your topics with me. The research papers can be based on a presentation paper or comment, but need not be.